

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

Sonja Rueckner, Jonathan Rueckner,

Plaintiff(s),

v.

BMW of North America, LLC, Bayerische
Motoren Werke, Aktiengesellschaft, and
Does 1 to 10,

Defendant(s).

Case No. 8:18-cv-01522-SB (ADSx)

STIPULATED PROTECTIVE ORDER

I. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

A. Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that this Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from

1 public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that
2 are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles. The
3 parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section XIII(C), below, that this
4 Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information
5 under seal; Civil Local Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed
6 and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the
7 Court to file material under seal.

8 **II. GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT**

9 A. This action is likely to involve trade secrets, customer and pricing lists
10 and other valuable research, development, commercial, financial, technical
11 and/or proprietary information for which special protection from public
12 disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecution of this action is
13 warranted. Such confidential and proprietary materials and information consist
14 of, among other things, confidential business or financial information,
15 information regarding confidential business practices, or other confidential
16 research, development, or commercial information (including information
17 implicating privacy rights of third parties), information otherwise generally
18 unavailable to the public, or which may be privileged or otherwise protected
19 from disclosure under state or federal statutes, court rules, case decisions, or
20 common law. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the
21 prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery materials, to
22 adequately protect information the parties are entitled to keep confidential, to
23 ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such material
24 in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at the

1 end of the litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such
 2 information is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that
 3 information will not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that
 4 nothing be so designated without a good faith belief that it has been maintained
 5 in a confidential, non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not
 6 be part of the public record of this case.

7 **III. DEFINITIONS**

8 A. Action: Rueckner v. BMW NA, et al, case no. 8:18-cv-01522-SB-ADS.

9 B. Challenging Party: A Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation
 10 of information or items under this Order.

11 C. "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items: Information (regardless of how
 12 it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for
 13 protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in
 14 the Good Cause Statement.

15 D. Counsel: Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their
 16 support staff).

17 E. Designating Party: A Party or Non-Party that designates information or
 18 items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as
 19 "CONFIDENTIAL."

20 F. Disclosure or Discovery Material: All items or information, regardless of
 21 the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained
 22 (including, among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible things), that
 23 are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this
 24 matter.

1 G. Expert: A person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter
2 pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to
3 serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

4 H. House Counsel: Attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action.
5 House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside
6 counsel.

7 I. Non-Party: Any natural person, partnership, corporation, association, or
8 other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

9 J. Outside Counsel of Record: Attorneys who are not employees of a party
10 to this Action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and
11 have appeared in this Action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law
12 firm which has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

13 K. Party: Any party to this Action, including all of its officers, directors,
14 employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and
15 their support staffs).

16 L. Producing Party: A Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or
17 Discovery Material in this Action.

18 M. Professional Vendors: Persons or entities that provide litigation support
19 services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or
20 demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or
21 medium) and their employees and subcontractors.

22 N. Protected Material: Any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is
23 designated as "CONFIDENTIAL."
24

O. Receiving Party: A Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a Producing Party.

IV. SCOPE

A. The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

B. Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

V. DURATION

A. Even after final disposition of this litigation, the confidentiality obligations imposed by this Order shall remain in effect until a Designating Party agrees otherwise in writing or a court order otherwise directs. Final disposition shall be deemed to be the later of (1) dismissal of all claims and defenses in this Action, with or without prejudice; and (2) final judgment herein after the completion and exhaustion of all appeals, rehearings, remands, trials, or reviews of this Action, including the time limits for filing any motions or applications for extension of time pursuant to applicable law.

VI. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

A. Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection

1. Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The

1 Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts of
2 material, documents, items, or oral or written communications that
3 qualify so that other portions of the material, documents, items, or
4 communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept
5 unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order.

6 2. Mass, indiscriminate, or routinized designations are prohibited.
7 Designations that are shown to be clearly unjustified or that have been
8 made for an improper purpose (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case
9 development process or to impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on
10 other parties) may expose the Designating Party to sanctions.

11 3. If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or
12 items that it designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that
13 Designating Party must promptly notify all other Parties that it is
14 withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

15 B. Manner and Timing of Designations

16 1. Except as otherwise provided in this Order (*see, e.g.*, Section
17 B(2)(b) below), or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or
18 Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must be
19 clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

20 2. Designation in conformity with this Order requires the following:

21 a. For information in documentary form (e.g., paper or
22 electronic documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or
23 other pretrial or trial proceedings), that the Producing Party affix
24 at a minimum, the legend "CONFIDENTIAL" (hereinafter

1 "CONFIDENTIAL legend"), to each page that contains protected
2 material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page
3 qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly
4 identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate
5 markings in the margins).

6 b. A Party or Non-Party that makes original documents
7 available for inspection need not designate them for protection
8 until after the inspecting Party has indicated which documents it
9 would like copied and produced. During the inspection and before
10 the designation, all of the material made available for inspection
11 shall be deemed "CONFIDENTIAL." After the inspecting Party has
12 identified the documents it wants copied and produced, the
13 Producing Party must determine which documents, or portions
14 thereof, qualify for protection under this Order. Then, before
15 producing the specified documents, the Producing Party must affix
16 the "CONFIDENTIAL legend" to each page that contains Protected
17 Material. If only a portion or portions of the material on a page
18 qualifies for protection, the Producing Party also must clearly
19 identify the protected portion(s) (e.g., by making appropriate
20 markings in the margins).

21 c. For testimony given in depositions, that the Designating
22 Party identify the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record,
23 before the close of the deposition all protected testimony.
24

d. For information produced in form other than document and for any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent place on the exterior of the container or containers in which the information is stored the legend "CONFIDENTIAL." If only a portion or portions of the information warrants protection, the Producing Party, to the extent practicable, shall identify the protected portion(s).

C. Inadvertent Failure to Designate

1. If timely corrected, an inadvertent failure to designate qualified information or items does not, standing alone, waive the Designating Party's right to secure protection under this Order for such material.

Upon timely correction of a designation, the Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

VII. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS

A. Timing of Challenges

1. Any party or Non-Party may challenge a designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the Court's Scheduling Order.

B. Meet and Confer

1. The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute resolution process under Local Rule 37.1 et seq.

C. The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an improper

purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived or withdrawn the confidentiality designation, all parties shall continue to afford the material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under the Producing Party's designation until the Court rules on the challenge.

VIII. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL

A. Basic Principles

1. A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection with this Action only for prosecuting, defending, or attempting to settle this Action. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to the categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order. When the Action has been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply with the provisions of Section XIV below.

2. Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party at a location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited to the persons authorized under this Order.

B. Disclosure of "CONFIDENTIAL" Information or Items

1. Unless otherwise ordered by the Court or permitted in writing by the Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any information or item designated "CONFIDENTIAL" only to:

a. The Receiving Party's Outside Counsel of Record in this Action, as well as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to

1 whom it is reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this
2 Action;

3 b. The officers, directors, and employees (including House
4 Counsel) of the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably
5 necessary for this Action;

6 c. Experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to
7 whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who
8 have signed the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound"
9 (Exhibit A);

10 d. The Court and its personnel;

11 e. Court reporters and their staff;

12 f. Professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and
13 Professional Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary
14 or this Action and who have signed the "Acknowledgment and
15 Agreement to be Bound" attached as Exhibit A hereto;

16 g. The author or recipient of a document containing the
17 information or a custodian or other person who otherwise
18 possessed or knew the information;

19 h. During their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for
20 witnesses, in the Action to whom disclosure is reasonably
21 necessary provided: (i) the deposing party requests that the
22 witness sign the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound;"
23 and (ii) they will not be permitted to keep any confidential
24 information unless they sign the "Acknowledgment and Agreement

to Be Bound," unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the Court. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

i. Any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel, mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

IX. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION

A. If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as "CONFIDENTIAL," that Party must:

1. Promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;
2. Promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Stipulated Protective Order; and
3. Cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected.

1 B. If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served
 2 with the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated
 3 in this action as "CONFIDENTIAL" before a determination by the Court from
 4 which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the
 5 Designating Party's permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden
 6 and expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material and
 7 nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a
 8 Receiving Party in this Action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

9 **X. A NON-PARTY'S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE**
 10 **PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION**

11 A. The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-
 12 Party in this Action and designated as "CONFIDENTIAL." Such information
 13 produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the
 14 remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should
 15 be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

16 B. In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to
 17 produce a Non-Party's confidential information in its possession, and the Party
 18 is subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party's
 19 confidential information, then the Party shall:

- 20 1. Promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party
- 21 that some or all of the information requested is subject to a
- 22 confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;
- 23
- 24

1 2. Promptly provide the Non-Party with a copy of the Stipulated
2 Protective Order in this Action, the relevant discovery request(s), and a
3 reasonably specific description of the information requested; and

4 3. Make the information requested available for inspection by the
5 Non-Party, if requested.

6 C. If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court within 14
7 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the Receiving Party
8 may produce the Non-Party's confidential information responsive to the
9 discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective order, the
10 Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession or control
11 that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party before a
12 determination by the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the Non-Party
13 shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this court of its
14 Protected Material.

15 **XI. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

16 A. If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has
17 disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not
18 authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must
19 immediately (1) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized
20 disclosures, (2) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the
21 Protected Material, (3) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized
22 disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and (4) request such person
23 or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to be Bound" that is
24 attached hereto as Exhibit A.

**XII. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR OTHERWISE
PROTECTED MATERIAL**

A. When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the Stipulated Protective Order submitted to the Court.

XIII. MISCELLANEOUS

A. Right to Further Relief

1. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its modification by the Court in the future.

B. Right to Assert Other Objections

1. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order, no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

C. Filing Protected Material

1 1. A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected Material must
2 comply with Civil Local Rule 79-5. Protected Material may only be filed
3 under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific
4 Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material
5 under seal is denied by the Court, then the Receiving Party may file the
6 information in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the Court.

7 **XIV. FINAL DISPOSITION**

8 A. After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in Section V, within
9 sixty (60) days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving
10 Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such
11 material. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies,
12 abstracts, compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or
13 capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether the Protected Material is
14 returned or destroyed, the Receiving Party must submit a written certification to
15 the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the Designating
16 Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate)
17 all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the
18 Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries
19 or any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material.
20 Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to retain an archival copy of
21 all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal
22 memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports,
23 attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such
24 materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or

1 constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth
2 in Section V.

3 B. Any violation of this Order may be punished by any and all appropriate
4 measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary
5 sanctions.

6
7
8 **IT IS SO STIPULATED, THROUGH COUNSEL OF RECORD.**

9 Dated: February 1, 2021

/s/ Adam Rose

Attorney(s) for Plaintiff(s)

11 Dated: February 1, 2021

/s/ Steve Meyer

Attorney(s) for Defendant(s)

13 **FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.**

14
15 Dated: 2/3/2021

/s/ Autumn D. Spaeth

HONORABLE AUTUMN D. SPAETH

United States Magistrate Judge

EXHIBIT A
ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, _____ [print or type full name], of _____
 _____ [print or type full address], declare under penalty of perjury that I
 have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated Protective Order that was issue
 by the United States District Court for the Central District of California on [DATE] in
 the case of _____ [insert formal name of the case and the
 number and initials assigned to it by the Court]. I agree to comply with and to be
 bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and
 acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment in
 the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner any
 information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any person or
 entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order.

I further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court
 for the Central District of California for the purpose of enforcing the terms of this
 Stipulated Protective Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after
 termination of this action. I hereby appoint _____ [print or
 type full name] of _____ [print or type full address and
 telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with this
 action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective Order.

Date: _____

City and State where sworn and signed: _____

Printed Name: _____

Signature: _____